

Kwok Chun Man, Vince (CMC non-degree seeking exchange)

Professor Lynne Miyake

JPNT179 Graphically Speaking: Japanese *Manga* and Its Buds

4/30/2013

Critique

This project and presentation have touched on a topic which is unfamiliar with Western readers. For this reason, some concepts which are mentioned from time to time are quite cultural-specific, e.g. *wuguan*, the concept of triad gangs in Hong Kong and the like. While descriptions or literal translations are provided at times to explain these concepts briefly, there is one thing that I hope this paper would also discuss, namely, the significance of martial arts in Hong Kong popular culture. This research paper has offered explanation as to why martial arts is not for women; yet the reason why martial arts is important for and well regarded by men is a bit lacking. The argument would be more effective as well as convincing if the men's perspective is also taken into account—some questions that might be asked can be, for example, why it is important to satisfy the male gaze in Hong Kong *manhua*, or why men expect to and are willing to see political debates in comics, or even why men do not expect to see a heroine in these comic books, to name just a few. As far as is investigated in this research

paper, the discussion mainly revolves around why various prominent features which characterize Hong Kong *manhua* are not for women and therefore fail to attract a female readership, but not around why they sustain a male readership over all the years. The whole research would be more comprehensive if the latter part is also concerned.

Another issue is that it is mentioned for a few times that many female readers in Hong Kong prefer *manga* over local *manhua*. While it is understood and thoroughly discussed that why *manhua* is not interesting to women, I hope this paper would further investigate why *manga*, as well as what particular elements from *manga*, is attractive enough for them. Could it be the fact that there are more opportunities for heroines in *manga* than in Hong Kong *manhua*? Or could it be that there are more *manga* pieces, for instance the shojo-type ones, that highlight personal relationship rather than gender dominance of male over female as portrayed in Hong Kong *manhua*? Once again, this research paper would be more comprehensive if it concerns not just what Hong Kong women do not want from comic books, but also what they actually expect from comic books.